

Outcomes Framework

June 2021

The purpose of the outcomes framework is to identify descriptive quantitative metrics that can be used across Chicago's middle-skills pathways system as a whole, for groupings of programs, or for specific programs. The descriptive information and metrics in this framework can help funders, policymakers, and system administrators to better understand the context for middle skills pathway program delivery in Chicago, and the outcomes associated with those programs.

The outcomes framework is divided into two broad categories: (1) contextual information describing the numbers of participants and programs by various categories; and (2) outcomes metrics that can be utilized to assess year-over-year impacts relating to participants in the pathways system.

The listed outcomes metrics cluster into two categories-- Education Outcomes and Employment Outcomes. Within categories, overarching guiding questions further group the metrics. This category-question taxonomy provides a framework to inform metrics strategy and use. Calculating the listed metrics will typically entail integrating data from disparate data sources. Pathways data are commonly interagency and siloed, and integrating them requires keys for matching data across sources. The necessary keys will vary per the granularity of the metric and data of interest. Use of participant-level identifiers [and data] requires legal authorization, which is assumed for selected internal staff (e.g., college/program leadership or analysts) but is governed by data sharing/access agreements for qualified external parties (e.g., academic researchers, staff from other agencies, funders).

As these metrics are deployed, all data should be disaggregated to promote greater understanding of differences and possible inequities across participant subgroups. Where possible, data should be disaggregated by demography (e.g., race/ethnicity, gender, low-income status, etc.) and, where relevant, by pathway sector (e.g., IT, health sciences, etc.). Data should also be disaggregated by pathway entry point as defined in the Middle Skills Pathways framework and glossary (strategic dual credit pathway participant, bridge program participant, non-credit articulation, etc.).

The listed metrics are intended as a reference for subsequent pathways analyses, and will not be applicable to every potential project, nor are they exhaustive. Generally, metrics will vary in their purpose and scope as well as the data required to create them. Likewise, partners and projects will differ in context and interest and may focus on different facets of pathways participation and success. Users of this framework should treat it as a reference tool that supplements their context-specific metrics work.

Middle Skills Pathways Contextual Information

Context – Participants

What are the numbers and demographic characteristics of individuals enrolled in middle skills pathway programs?

- By program type
- By sector
- By pathway/occupational focus
- By participant age (under 18, 18-19, 20-21, 22-24, 25-29, 30-34, 35-39, 40-49, 50-64, 65 and over)

How do program enrollment demographic characteristics compare to existing (age 25 - 44) and emerging (under age 25) workforce demographic characteristics?

What are the numbers and demographic characteristics of individuals completing middle skills pathway programs? How do the completion numbers compare to projected workforce demand in particular sectors and for particular occupations?

Context – Provider and Programs

How many middle skills pathway programs exist in Chicago (total within the City, and mapped)?

- By industry sector
- By program type and occupational focus
- By entry education requirement (GED/no GED)
- By programs leading to High Priority Occupations, and those that do not

How many private training providers have formal agreements with CCC for pathway progression? What sectors and occupational focus areas are represented?

How many CCC associates degree programs have formal transfer agreements for bachelor's degree completion? What sectors and universities are represented?

What is the total cost and average net price of various middle skill pathway programs and pathway progressions?



Middle-Skills Pathways Outcomes Metrics

Education Outcomes

1. Are students persisting through middle-skills pathway programs and earning credentials?

- a. *Fall-to-Spring Retention*: Of those students entering long-term (catalog time of 1 year or more) programs in a given year, % of first-time, full-time degree seeking students retained from fall-to-spring
- b. *Fall-to-Fall Retention*: Of those students entering associate degree programs in a given year, % of first-time, full-time degree seeking students retained from fall-to-fall
- c. *Credit Accumulation – 20 credits*: Of those students entering associate degree programs in a given year, % of first-time, full-time degree seeking students accumulating 20 credits during their first year of postsecondary enrollment
- d. *Credit Accumulation – 30 credits*: Of those entering associate degree programs in a given year, % of first-time, full-time degree seeking students accumulating 30 credits during their first year of postsecondary enrollment
- e. *Credential Program Advancement (Non-Community College)*: Of those students entering a non-community college certificate program in a given year, % advancing within 150% of catalog time. Breakdown into 5 categories:
 - i. Students who completed a program with a catalog time of less than 1 year
 - ii. Students who completed a program with a catalog time of more than 1 year
 - iii. Students who did not complete a program but have transferred to another program or college
 - iv. Students who did not complete a program but are still enrolled
 - v. Students who did not complete a program and are not currently enrolled
- f. *Community College Advancement*: Of those students entering associate degree programs in a given year (first-time, full-time), % advancing within 150% of catalog time. Breakdown into 5 categories:
 - i. Students who completed a program with a catalog time of 2 years or more, but less than 4 years
 - ii. Students who completed a program with a catalog time of less than 2 years
 - iii. Students who did not complete a program of study but have transferred to another institution
 - iv. Students who did not complete a program of study but are still enrolled
 - v. Students who did not complete a program of study and are not currently enrolled



2. Are students continuing their pathway through postsecondary and earning related credentials?

- a. *Enrollment in Further Education – Short-term:* % of participants completing a short-term certificate (catalog time of less than 1 year) in a particular year and enrolling in a related postsecondary program at an Illinois community college within a three-year postsecondary analytical period
- b. *Enrollment in Further Education – Long-term:* % of participants completing a long-term certificate (catalog time of 1 year or more) in a particular year and enrolling in a related postsecondary program at an Illinois community college within a three-year postsecondary analytical period
- c. *Subsequent Postsecondary Enrollment:* % of those earning a credential from a middle skills pathway program enrolling in further postsecondary education within a three-year, post-completion, analytical period (with analysis of whether the subsequent postsecondary education program is in the same 2-digit CIP, or a different CIP than the original program)
 - i. *Pathway University Degree Attainment - Participants:* % of those earning a credential from a middle skills pathway program and earning a related degree from a university within a six-year postsecondary analytical period

Employment Outcomes

Note: Employment outcomes are generally longer-term than the prior outcome areas and involve more complicated systems for data access and analysis. The below outcomes should be further developed with State agency partners and, where possible, supplemented by information collected by program providers (such as surveys of program completers, or employer reports).

3. Are students continuing their postsecondary pathways into employment?

- a. *Employed in Pathway Sector:* Of students earning a middle skills pathway credential in a pathway area (using 2-digit CIP code) during the analytical time period and not continuing enrollment in postsecondary, % employed in the same sector (using NAICS Code)
- b. *Employed in IL:* Of students earning a credential during the analytical time period, % employed in IL in reference quarter (t) after credential attainment. Proposed reference quarters (t):
 - i. 2nd quarter after attainment
 - ii. 4th quarter after attainment
 - iii. 8th quarter after attainment
 - iv. 12th quarter after attainment
- c. *Employed in Chicago Metropolitan Area:* Of students earning a credential during the analytical time period, % employed in the Chicago metropolitan area in reference quarter (t) after credential attainment. Proposed reference quarters (t):
 - i. 2nd quarter after attainment
 - ii. 4th quarter after attainment
 - iii. 8th quarter after attainment



- d. *Stable Employment*: Of students earning a credential during the analytical time period, % working for the same Illinois employer for at least 3 consecutive quarters in reference quarters (t-1), (t), and (t+1) after credential attainment. Proposed reference quarters (t):
 - i. 4th quarter after attainment
 - ii. 8th quarter after attainment
 - iii. 12th quarter after attainment

4. Are students earning postsecondary credentials initially employed at a living wage and then experiencing earnings growth?

- a. *Earning a Living Wage*: Of students (1) earning a credential during the analytical time period; (2) employed in IL in reference quarter (t) after credential attainment, the previous (t-1) quarter, and the subsequent (t+1) quarter; and (3) not subsequently enrolled in further postsecondary education, the % with (t) quarter earnings at or above 85% of the living wage threshold for 1 Adult and 1 Child in the Chicago metropolitan statistical area, based on MIT's Living Wage Calculator. Proposed reference quarters (t):
 - i. 2nd quarter after attainment
 - ii. 4th quarter after attainment
 - iii. 8th quarter after attainment
 - iv. 12th quarter after attainment

(Note: if the individual is employed with two Illinois employers, the highest-paying job is selected)

- b. *Annual Earnings Growth*: Using the earning calculation in (a), determining the difference in average annual earnings between (i) the year before credential attainment, (ii) the first year after credential attainment, and (iii) the second (and subsequent) year after credential attainment.

